COMMITTEE ON
POPULATION AND DEMOGRAPHY Report No. 4

Age Misreporting and Age-Selective Underenumeration: Sources, Patterns, and Consequences for Demographic Analysis

Douglas C. Ewbank

Panel on Data Collection
Committee on Population and Demography
Assembly of Behavioral and Social Sciences
National Research Council

NATIONAL ACADEMY PRESS
Washington, D.C. 1981

NOTICE: The project that is the subject of this report was approved by the Governing Board of the National Research Council, whose members are drawn from the councils of the National Academy of Sciences, the National Academy of Engineering, and the Institute of Medicine. The members of the Committee responsible for the report were chosen for their special competences and with regard for appropriate balance.

This report has been reviewed by a group other than the authors according to procedures approved by a Report Review Committee consisting of members of the National Academy of Sciences, the National Academy of Engineering, and the Institute of Medicine.

The National Research Council was established by the National Academy of Sciences in 1916 to associate the broad community of science and technology with the Academy's purposes of furthering knowledge and of advising the federal government. The Council operates in accordance with general policies determined by the Academy under the authority of its congressional charter of 1863, which establishes the Academy as a private, nonprofit, self-governing membership corporation. The Council has become the principal operating agency of both the National Academy of Sciences and the National Academy of Engineering in the conduct of their services to the government, the public, and the scientific and engineering communities. It is administered jointly by both Academies and the Institute of Medicine. The National Academy of Engineering and the Institute of Medicine were established in 1964 and 1970, respectively, under the charter of the National Academy of Sciences.

Library of Congress Catalog Card Number 81-81759

International Standard Book Number 0-309-03141-9

Available from

NATIONAL ACADEMY PRESS
2101 Constitution Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20418

Printed in the United States of America

PANEL ON DATA COLLECTION

WILLIAM SELTZER (Chairman), Statistical Office, United Nations
LESLIE KISH, Institute for Social Research, University of Michigan
FORREST E. LINDER, International Institute for Vital Registration and and Statistics
SAMUEL H. PRESTON, Population Studies Center, University of Pennsylvania
CHRISTOPHER SCOTT, World Fertility Survey
CONRAD TAEUBER, Georgetown University
JACQUES VALLIN, Institut National d'Etudes Demographiques, Paris
H. BRADLEY WELLS, Population Laboratories, University of North Carolina

ROBERT J. LAPHAM, Study Director

COMMITTEE ON POPULATION AND DEMOGRAPHY

ANSLEY J. COALE (Chairman), Office of Population Research, Princeton University
WILLIAM BRASS, Centre for Population Studies, London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine
LEE-JAY CHO, East-West Population Institute, East-West Center, Honolulu
RONALD FREEDMAN, Population Studies Center, University of Michigan
NATHAN KEYFITZ, Department of Sociology, Harvard University
LESLIE KISH, Institute for Social Research, University of Michigan
W. PARKER MAULDIN, Population Division, The Rockefeller Foundation, New York
JANE MENKEN, Office of Population Research, Princeton University
SAMUEL PRESTON, Population Studies Center, University of Pennsylvania
WILLIAM SELTZER, Statistical Office, United Nations
CONRAD TAEUBER, Kennedy Institute, Center for Population Research, Georgetown University
ETIENNE VAN DE WALLE, Population Studies Center, University of Pennsylvania

ROBERT J. LAPHAM, Study Director

NOTE: Members of the Committee and its panels and working groups participated in this project in their individual capacities; the listing of their organizational affiliation is for identification purposes only, and the views and designations used in this report are not necessarily those of the organizations mentioned.

Contents

LIST OF TABLES viii

PREFACE xi

1 INTRODUCTION 1

2 SOURCES OF AGE MISREPORTING 4

The Knowledge of Age 5
Indirect Procedures for Estimating Ages 9
The Interview Process 11
Errors Introduced in Data Processing 16

3 METHODS FOR DETECTING ERRORS IN REPORTED AGE DISTRIBUTIONS 18

Completeness Errors and Content Errors 19
Post-Enumeration Surveys (PES) and Matching of Independent Surveys 21
Comparison of Sources 29
Cross-Tabulating by Age to Identify Age Misreporting 30
Analyzing Cohort Survival Rates 36
Stable Population Analysis 40

4 TYPICAL PATTERNS OF DISTORTION IN REPORTED AGE DISTRIBUTIONS 46

Age Misreporting for Infants, Young Children, and Adolescents 48
Age Distribution Distortions and Underenumeration at Ages 15-29 59
Reporting Errors For Those Over Age 30 66

5 THE EFFECT OF ERRORS ON THE ESTIMATION OF FERTILITY AND MORTALITY RATES: PROBLEMS AND RECOMMENDED SOLUTIONS 70

The Effect of Age Distribution Distortions on Stable Population Analysis 70
Age Misreporting and the Brass "Growth Balance" Technique 74
The Effects of Age Distribution Errors on the Brass Techniques for Estimating Fertility and Child Mortality 74
The Effect of Age Misreporting on the Brass Parental Survival Technique for Estimating Mortality 80

6 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH 83

Summary 87

APPENDIX: The Usefulness of Historical Calendars 89

GLOSSARY 97

REFERENCES 105

List of Tables

1. Estimated Proportions of Different Age-Sex Groups Omitted from Census Relative to the Overall Undercount: Seven Populations 20
2. Comparison of the Age Distributions from the Census and the Post-Enumeration Survey: Ghana 1960 22
3. Percentage of Persons Enumerated in the Same Five-Year Age Group During a Survey and a Reinterview: Nine Populations 26
4. Age and Sex Ratios for the 1972 Paraguayan Census, With and Without Adjustments for Age-Selective Underenumeration 32
5. Comparisons of Reports of Average Parity and Births in the Last Year by Single Year of Age: Nepal 1976 and Ghana 1971 34
6. Census Survival Ratios Divided by Appropriate Life Table Survival Ratios for Children and Young Adults in the Indian Censuses of 1881-1961: Areas Common to All Nine Censuses 37
7. Ten-Year Census Survival Rates for the Native-Born Population of Ghana, Adjusted for Mortality and Estimated Age Reporting Errors 39
8. Stable Population Analysis of the Reported and Adjusted Age Distributions: Paraguay 1972 42
9. Stable Population Analysis of the Reported and Adjusted Age Distributions: Liberia 1974 44
10. Gross Errors in Reported Ages of Children Aged 0-14, Expressed in Percentages: Ghana, Senegal, and Gambia 50

11. Mean Error in Reported Ages of Children Aged 0-14: Ghana and Senegal 51
12. Adjustment Factors for Net Age Misreporting for Infants: Evaluation Study, 1971 Census of India 52
13. Ratio of the Reported Population Aged x to the Reported Population Aged x + 1 for Ages 0-13: 19 African Censuses 54
14. Simulation of Age Misreporting at Ages 3-14, Sexes Combined: Based on Pison's Study in Senegal 56
15. Estimated Omission Rates of Children Aged 0, 1, and 2: Evaluation Study, 1971 Census of India 58
16. Estimates of Age Misreporting for Ages 15-29: Gambia, Indonesia, and Nigeria 60
17. Percentage of Age Misreporting by Age, Marital Status, and Parity, for Women Aged 15-24: Nigeria 1969 63
18. Number of Ever-Married Women by Age, Number of Surviving Children, and Misreporting of Age: Indonesia 1976 63
19. Percentage Undercount for Ages 12-19: Korea 1970 64
20. Underenumeration of Ever-Married Women by Age and Parity: Korea, 1960 Census 65
21. Percentage Estimates of Completeness of Enumeration by Relationship to Household Head and by Migrant Status: Paraguay and Korea 66
22. Evidence of Digit Preference Among Persons Aged 40-69: Gambia 1971 67
23. Age Misreporting at Ages 30-69: Gambia 1971 69
24. Quasi-Stable Population Tests of Minimal Adjustments for Age Distribution Distortions: Ghanaian Males, 1970 73
25. Estimates of Fertility and Child Mortality Derived from Different Age Groupings: Ashanti Region, Ghana 1971 76
26. Simulations of the Effect of Age Misreporting on Brass Child Mortality Estimates 78
27. Simulation of the Sensitivity of the Brass Parental Survival Method to Age Misreporting 80

A-1. Percentage of Agreement Between Ages Reported in Response to a Simple Question on Age and Ages Estimated by Alternative Approaches: Nigeria 93
A-2. Net Percentage of Respondents Overstating Their Age, Based on Three Age-Estimation Techniques: Nigeria 95

Preface

The Committee on Population and Demography was established in April 1977 by the National Research Council, in response to a request by the Agency for International Development (AID) of the U.S. Department of State. It was widely felt by those concerned that the time was ripe for a detailed review of levels and trends of fertility and mortality in the developing world. Although most people in the demographic community agree that mortality has declined in almost all developing countries during the last 30 years, there is uncertainty about more recent changes in mortality in some countries, about current levels of fertility, and about the existence and extent of recent changes in fertility.

In 1963, a Panel on Population Problems of the Committee on Science and Public Policy of the National Academy of Sciences published a report entitled The Growth of World Population. The appointment of that panel and the publication of its report were expressions of the concern then felt by scientists, as well as by other informed persons in many countries, about the implications of population trends. At that time, the most consequential trend was the pronounced and long-continued acceleration in the rate of increase of the population of the world and especially of the population of the poorer countries. It was estimated in 1963 that the annual rate of increase of the global population had reached 2 percent, a rate that, if

continued, would cause the total to double every 35 years. The disproportionate contribution of low-income areas to that acceleration was caused by rapid declines in mortality combined with high fertility that remained almost unchanged: the birth rate was nearly fixed or declined more modestly than the death rate.

Since the earlier report, however, the peak rate of growth in the world's population has apparently been passed. A dramatic decline in the birth rate in almost all the more developed countries has lowered their aggregate annual rate of increase to well below 1 percent, and the peak rate of increase has also apparently been passed in the less-developed parts of the world as a whole. A sharp decline in fertility in many low-income areas has more than offset the generally continued reduction in the death rate, although the rate of population increase remains high in almost all less-developed countries.

The causes of the reductions in fertility--whether they are the effect primarily of such general changes as lowered infant mortality, increasing education, urban rather than rural residence, and improving status of women or of such particular changes as spreading knowledge of and access to efficient methods of contraception or abortion--are strongly debated. There are also divergent views of the appropriate national and international policies on population in the face of these changing trends. The differences in opinion extend to different beliefs and assertions about what the population trends really are in many of the less-developed countries. Because births and deaths are recorded very incompletely in much of Africa, Asia, and Latin America, levels and trends of fertility and mortality must be estimated, and disagreement has arisen in some instances about reasonably reliable methods for estimating those levels and trends.

It was to examine these questions that the Committee on Population and Demography was established within the Assembly of Behavioral and Social Sciences of the National Research Council. It was funded for a period of three years by AID under Contract No. AID/pha-C-1161. The Committee has undertaken three major tasks:

1. To evaluate available evidence and prepare estimates of levels and trends of fertility and mortality in selected developing nations;